

IMAGINING ST. AUGUSTINE:
CARTOGRAPHY, URBAN SPACE, SPECTACLE, 1586-1702

A THESIS

SUBMITTED ON THE THIRTIETH DAY OF APRIL 2022

TO THE DEPARTMENT OF HISTORY

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS

OF THE SCHOOL OF LIBERAL ARTS

OF TULANE UNIVERSITY

FOR THE DEGREE

OF

MASTER OF ARTS

BY

Keith
Richards


Digitally signed by Keith
Richards
Date: 2022.04.26
11:07:31 -05'00'

Keith Richards

APPROVED: **Guadalupe Garcia**

Digitally signed by
Guadalupe Garcia
Date: 2022.04.27
15:08:48 -05'00'

Guadalupe García, Ph.D.
Director

 Digitally signed by Kris
Lane
Date: 2022.04.28
09:43:11 -05'00'

Kris Lane, Ph.D.



James Boyden, Ph.D.

Table of Contents

<i>Introduction</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>Cartography</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>Urban Space</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>Spectacle</i>	<i>20</i>
<i>Conclusion</i>	<i>31</i>
<i>Bibliography</i>	<i>35</i>

Introduction

Amy Bushnell, in her seminal study on the Spanish Florida treasury, opened her conclusion with the harrowing statement: “There should have been no Spanish colony in Florida.”¹ She ultimately concludes that despite this fact, St. Augustine persisted and survived when many other Spanish American cities did not, and so it merits understanding how. St. Augustine’s survival, as Ruth MacKay describes townships in Castile during the plague of 1596-1601, “triumph[s] over all the economists’ models, theories, and structures,” and demonstrates the necessity to reevaluate the way that historians analyze the history of the city, especially in the 17th century.² Despite the supposed poverty of the city and the near starvations that its denizens endured, the population rose from 625 in 1598 to 1225 white people and 2796 indigenous people in 1702, according to one estimate.³

The historiographic problem stems from the approach that most historians take when studying St. Augustine – the focus on the city as “America’s Oldest City” implicitly orients the conversation to explain what conditions allowed the United States to seize control of it and become a part of the Union.⁴ This anachronistic perspective allows exaggerations to abound when considering the sparse documentation that has

¹ Amy Bushnell, *The King’s Coffer: Proprietors of the Spanish Florida Treasury, 1565-1702* (Gainesville: University Presses of Florida, 1981), 137.

² Ruth MacKay, *Life in a Time of Pestilence: The Great Castilian Plague of 1596-1601* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019), 12.

³ Population Patterns, Box 21, GH 0001, Governor’s House Library (hereafter, GHL), St. Augustine, Florida.

⁴ See Herbert Eugene Bolton, *The Spanish Borderlands: A Chronicle of Old Florida and the Southwest* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1921), Michael V. Gannon, *The Cross in the Sand: The Early Catholic Church in Florida* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1965), John Frances Bannon, *The Spanish Borderlands Frontier, 1513-1821* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1970), and David J. Weber, *The Spanish Frontier in North America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992).

survived, taking complaints about the city's condition at face value. It is not incorrect to say that the city struggled to maintain self-sufficiency, but it ignores that the city grew throughout the 17th century, and a more complex society had developed by the 1680s.⁵ The historiography of the second Spanish Period (1784-1821) is far richer and more typical of Atlantic World historiography, in part because the documentation is richer, but the first Spanish Period (1565-1763) clearly has similar contours, despite its relative poverty.⁶

While still a small settlement, St. Augustine was decreed a city throughout the entire period of this study. Sidney David Markman argues that the “total panorama of colonial history” is centered on Mexico and Peru, leaving cities like St. Augustine as irrelevant to dominant narratives of the conquest and colonization of Spanish America.⁷ Cities like Havana eventually escaped the status of peripheral because they “housed both the institutions of state power and the writers who dealt in edicts, memoranda, reports, and all the official correspondence that held the empire together,” but St. Augustine never attained such colonial prominence, only having a governor and a handful of *criollo*

⁵ Other cities on the peripheries like New Orleans have increasingly received scholarly attention, while Florida and other Spanish peripheries have remained neglected. See Cécile Vidal, *Caribbean New Orleans: Empire, Race, and the Making of a Slave Society* (Williamsburg: Omohundro Institute of Early American History & Culture, 2019), and Jessica Marie Johnson, *Wicked Flesh: Black Women, Intimacy, and Freedom in the Atlantic World* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2020).

⁶ For the historiography of the First Spanish Period, see Kenneth R. Andrews, *The Spanish Caribbean: Trade and Plunder, 1530-1630* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1978), Bushnell, *The King's Coffin*, Eugene Lyon, *The Enterprise of Florida: Pedro Menendez de Aviles and the Spanish Conquest of 1565-1568* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1983), Engel Sluiter, *The Florida Situado: Quantifying the First Eighty Years, 1571-1651* (Gainesville: University of Florida Libraries, 1985), Robert L. Kapitzke, *Religion, Power, and Politics in Colonial St. Augustine* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2001), Paul E. Hoffman, *A New Andalusia and a Way to the Orient: The American Southeast During the Sixteenth Century* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University, 2004). For the historiography of the Second Spanish Period, see Jane Landers, *Black Society in Spanish Florida* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1999), Daniel L. Shafer, *Anna Madgigine Jai Kingsley: African Princess, Florida Slave, Plantation Slaveowner* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2003), Andrew McMichael, *Atlantic Loyalties: Americans in Spanish West Florida, 1785-1810* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2008).

⁷ Sidney David Markman, *Architecture and Urbanization in Colonial Chiapas, Mexico* (Philadelphia: The American Philosophical Society, 1984), 5.

bureaucrats like scribes and treasurers.⁸ While the *presidio* was deprived of lofty titles and status, it nonetheless did serve an important function within the Spanish imperial system – the protection of the channel for when the treasure fleet sailed along the coast. Its importance was so great – Royal Officer Joseph de Prado said it was necessary for the “public safety of the entire Indies” – that it was granted an annual subsidy (*situado*) from New Spain to subsist itself.⁹ As a result, St. Augustine was not only a pivotal part of the Spanish imperial system but also the way in which sovereignty was reinforced in Florida, a strategically necessary region.

The similarities of St. Augustine with other Spanish American cities stem from practices, laws, and decrees that were standardized by the Council of Indies. The sparse documentation of St. Augustine in the first Spanish Period can therefore be supplemented by documents from other cities, albeit sparingly. The goal of this methodology is to bridge documentary gaps, and to better understand how St. Augustine fits within the history of colonial Latin America. While being subjects of the Viceroyalty of New Spain, St. Augustinians often traveled to Havana for emergency supplies, and it was the Bishop of Cuba who made a visit to the city as early as 1606.¹⁰ Clearly the city did not exist in isolation, and its constant communication with the Metropole and the other Spanish American colonies helped maintain the Spanish American institutions that underpinned urban society in St. Augustine.

⁸ John Charles Chasteen, “Introduction,” in *The Lettered City*, Ángel Rama (Durham: Duke University Press, 1996), vii.

⁹ Joseph de Prado to the King, June 30, 1668, p. 2, MC 63, Box 2, Folder 6, The Brooks’ Transcripts, trans. Annie Averette, Saint Augustine Historical Society (hereafter, SAHS), St. Augustine, Florida.

¹⁰ 1606 Episcopal Visitation of Florida by Fray Juan de las Caveças de Altamirano, MS 0-16, John H. Hann Collection, University of Florida Digital Collection (hereafter, UFDC).
<https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00038874/00001>

The year range of this paper is not arbitrary. By May 30, 1586, Sir Francis Drake burned St. Augustine to the ground, and James Moore burned the city down again in late December 1702. Between these two episodes, a specific iteration of St. Augustine was built and developed. Although less developed and populated than the rebuilt St. Augustine of the late first Spanish Period (1705-1763), the St. Augustine of 1586-1702 saw several scandals between governors and clergy, the arrival of the Holy Office of the Inquisition, the building of the Castillo de San Marcos, and the failed execution of a condemned pirate.¹¹ Within these different events is evidence of a vibrant public life within the city, whose analysis can provide a framework for understanding similarly under documented spaces. The study of St. Augustine's urban spaces is still yet to be sufficiently documented, and that aspect is the principal interest of this paper.¹²

There is a fundamental difference between a history that happens *within* a city, and a history *of* a city. Decades of archaeological work in and around St. Augustine has filled gaps that the documentation left behind, and that work in part builds the foundation for an urban history. The paper will not seek to retrace Albert Manucy's *The Houses of St. Augustine, 1565-1821*, with its meticulous attention to detail regarding building materials and architecture, but rather elaborate on how the city is itself a historical agent that facilitates public rituals, whether that entails the military drilling in the plaza, the town celebrating the ascension of a king, or giving a criminal 200 lashes along a fixed route.

¹¹ Public feuds between the governors and the clergy are sufficiently covered by Robert L. Kapitzke's *Religion, Power, and Politics in Colonial St. Augustine*.

¹² Historians of St. Augustine are most often interested in conflicts with the British in Charleston, the missions in Florida's provinces, the emergent *mestizaje* of the town's population, and the *situado*.

The colonial city was imagined by people on both sides of the Atlantic, creating layered spaces that royal officials, governors, and the king navigate. Rama argues that “Iberian conquerors” viewed the Americas as a blank slate for them to project order and civilization upon in ways that they could not do in Europe, trampling upon indigenous groups in the process.¹³ Each layer has a descriptive term for clarity: royal designs, cartography, bureaucratic complaining, and subalterns. Cities were created in specific ways, as outlined by the lettered elite in a 1573 royal decree on “Ordinances Made for New Discoveries, Conquests, & Pacifications.”¹⁴ This Neoplatonist and Renaissance ideal comprised the royal design for how a city should be laid out. Cartographers depicted cities on paper, often having never seen the city themselves and instead relying on eyewitnesses.¹⁵ Bureaucrats constructed a different view of the city as they complained to the King about poverty and starvation within the city. They often conjured nostalgic views of the city even several decades earlier, describing it as idyllic in comparison to the miserable conditions that plagued them in the present. The final layer is that of the subalterns – those who did not create their own documents, and instead existed on the peripheries of the archive until they became relevant. In 17th century St. Augustine, these often were common soldiers, and convicted and enslaved laborers. Their occasional appearances force historians to reconsider their understanding of what St. Augustine really looked like, in which these people who had no voice formed the background of the high dramas being duked out in supplications and denunciations of

¹³ Rama, *The Lettered City*, 2.

¹⁴ His Majesty’s Ordinances Made for New Discoveries, Conquests, & Pacifications, July 13, 1573, trans. Edward W. Lawson, MC 63, Box 1, Folder 20, SAHS.

¹⁵ Barbara E. Mundy, *The Mapping of New Spain: Indigenous Cartography and the Maps of the Relaciones Geográficas* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996), 11.

each other. The archive gives conflicting pictures and images of colonial cities, so examining them necessitates viewing them through the lens of layered spaces.

The paper is divided into the three parts: cartography, urban space, and spectacle. Each part represents one of the layered spaces created by the documentary trail left behind. The cartography section will analyze the maps produced about St. Augustine by mostly European cartographers. No accurate gridded map of St. Augustine exists before the 18th century, which means that the maps were often more symbolic than representing any concrete truth about the city. Not all the maps were made by the Spanish, and imperial desires often colored the ways in which the city was depicted. Urban space analyzes the city through the lens of the 1573 royal decree about how cities should be laid out. St. Augustine has a similar configuration to other waterfront cities like New Orleans, which was founded in 1718 and possibly modeled after St. Augustine.¹⁶ The expectations of citizens regarding the maintenance of public space, as well as public access to natural resources for building are also of interest. Despite being across the Atlantic, Madrid still exercised significant control over how citizens could interact with the city as a construct, and their loyal bureaucrats were tasked with enforcing their decrees. The final section, spectacle, discusses the spectacle of public punishments, which are codified in local ordinances across the Caribbean, in the legal code for the Indies, and even in the *Siete Partidas*. Public punishments served to project power, with the lashings marking a physical scar and reminder of their crime, while simultaneously deterring neighbors who witness the punishment from committing similar crimes.

¹⁶ Dell Upton, "The Master Street of the World: The Levee," in *Streets: Critical Perspectives on Public Space*, eds. Zeynep Çelik, Diane Favro, and Richard Ingersoll (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994), 179.

St. Augustine is undoubtedly more complex when analyzed as a multi-layered space that fits within the constructs of other Iberian Atlantic cities.

Cartography

In 1686, German cartographer Jean David Zunner depicted St. Augustine as a small, established town guarded by a traditional European castle at the foot of a mountain range.¹⁷ Early maps of Spanish America often privileged symbolic spaces over accurate and measured representations of the city's reality.¹⁸ Zunner greatly differs from other cartographers depicting St. Augustine in his representation of the city as a stronghold and a beacon of civilization. The Castillo de San Marcos sits prominently in the background across from the Matanzas River with small houses inside of it, like a medieval castle protecting the neighboring hamlet. The strength of the Castillo in the image marks the ability of the city to defend itself from external threats, representing a "march of progress towards civilization."¹⁹ When the map was made, the Castillo had not even been completed yet, and would not be finished until 1695, almost a decade later. Furthermore, the design of the Castillo is a type of early modern fort called the *trace italienne*, or star fort, rather than the decidedly medieval design that he chooses to depict it as.

When looking at the foreground, the symbolism becomes clear that Zunner did not care about the accuracy of the map, nor had he even attempted to capture its genuine likeness. Standing on Anastasia Island, a barrier island on the other side of the Matanzas River from St. Augustine, are a handful of people, both indigenous and European, who marvel at the land and its civilization. On the river are a series of boats, implying active

¹⁷ Jean David Zunner, *St. Augus. de Floride* (Frankfurt, 1586), John Carter Brown Library (hereafter, JCBL), <https://jcb.lunaimaging.com/luna/servlet/detail/JCB~1~1~7143~11080003:St--Augus--de-Floride>

¹⁸ Richard L. Kagan, *Urban Images of the Hispanic World, 1493-1793* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000), 60.

¹⁹ Simon Pepper, "Siege law, siege ritual, and the symbolism of the city walls in Renaissance Europe," in *City Walls: The Urban Enceinte in Global Perspective*, ed. James D. Tracy (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 584.

sea trade with the city, and the city itself is protected by both natural geographic features (mountains that do not actually exist), and the Castillo.²⁰ Zunner reimagines St. Augustine as a strong defense for the safety of the Spanish Empire, and the use of voyeuristic outsiders allows the map's audience to place themselves in their footsteps in observing the city from afar.

Kings sought to create maps in the 16th and 17th centuries as the basis of creating knowledge of their dominions and reinforce their power through that knowledge.²¹ Understanding their domains, especially for the far-flung colonial holdings in Spanish America, gave Philip II and the other Spanish Habsburgs kings of the 17th century insight into how their colonial enterprises fared in ways that reports, and correspondence could not. It was not only the Spanish who sought to observe and understand St. Augustine, however; the famous 1589 map by Giovanni Battista Boazio during the Drake raid of St. Augustine in 1586 was commissioned by the English. The importance of St. Augustine within the Spanish imperial system made it a target for more than just the Spanish to want to understand how it was organized and potential points of attack.

Zunner's optimistic representation of St. Augustine stands in stark contrast to the maps that preceded him; perhaps the construction of the Castillo gave him inspiration to reimagine St. Augustine in ways that other cartographers had not done before. His representation is also the only visual depiction of the city that exists from the 17th century. While there are images of the coast of Florida and Virginia in the early 17th century, they do not show what the city looked like, instead showing the city as a near-

²⁰ Jean David Zunner, *St. Augus. de Floride* (Frankfurt, 1586), JCBL, <https://jcb.lunaimaging.com/luna/servlet/detail/JCB~1~1~7143~11080003:St--Augus--de-Floride>

²¹ John Hale, *The Civilization of Europe in the Renaissance* (New York: Atheneum, 1993), 16.

irrelevant dot among a landscape of other small settlement-dots.²² Even though St. Augustine had a gridded street layout since the late 16th century, not a single map of the city included that until the map made by military engineer Antonio de Arredondo in 1737.²³ While many of these cartographers most likely never saw the city, and instead had to rely on eyewitnesses for an understanding of what it looked like, the question arises of why they would overlook such a basic detail.

The Boazio map, the earliest map of St. Augustine, depicts Drake's 1586 raid on St. Augustine, in which the settlement was burned to the ground. While some historians have attempted to use it to find specific buildings and institutions, it has been long-since been discredited as accurately representing how St. Augustine appeared at the time.²⁴ Boazio was commissioned by the English to depict it, creating a map that celebrated a definitive victory of the English over their enemies the Spanish. The city is depicted as small, comprised of nine blocks, with a wooden fort far from where most of the fighting took place.²⁵ Boazio, having never been to St. Augustine, almost certainly looked to other Spanish American cities to better understand how the typical Spanish American city was laid out, unaware that St. Augustine was yet to have laid out the city in a gridded layout.²⁶

²² Johannes Janssonius van Waesberge, Gerhard Mercator, and Johannes Cloppenburg, *Virginiae item et Floridae Americae Provinciarum, nova descriptio* (Amsterdam, 1636), David Rumsey Map Collection (hereafter, DRMC),

https://www.davidrumsey.com/luna/servlet/detail/RUMSEY~8~1~291841~90063288:Virginiae-item-et-Floridae-Americae?sort=Pub_List_No_InitialSort%2CPub_Date%2CPub_List_No%2CSeries_No

²³ Antonio de Arredondo, *City Plan of St. Augustine* (1737), UFDC, <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/USACH00201/00001>

²⁴ Albert Manucy, "The Physical Setting of Sixteenth Century St. Augustine," *The Florida Archaeologist* 38, no. 1 (March 1985), 34.

²⁵ Giovanni Battista Boazio, *Saint Augustine Map* (1589), Library of Congress, https://www.loc.gov/resource/gdcwdl.wdl_03936/?r=0.007,0.087,0.225,0.103,0

²⁶ Boazio was commissioned to depict several of the cities raided by Drake, among them Santo Domingo. The 1689 map of Santo Domingo, which was gridded, bears similarity to how he depicts St. Augustine. https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/Category:Baptista_Boazio#/media/File:Boazio-Sir_Francis_Drake_in_Santo_Domingo.jpg

Similarly, the English may have wanted to depict St. Augustine as a greater threat, worthy of being raided by Sir Francis Drake, who represented Queen Elizabeth in his attacks on the Spanish Main.

The anonymous 1595 map of St. Augustine, most likely made by a Spanish cartographer, depicts the city in a far worse state. With the gridded layout already having been laid out, the map puzzlingly only depicts a handful of buildings, as well as a gigantic fort.²⁷ While the cartographer who made it is unknown, there is clearly a cartographic desire to depict the city as an impoverished *presidio* whose sole purpose was to defend the annual treasure fleet traveling up the channel. If the depiction of a strong fort could imply civilization and sovereignty, the exposed buildings of the city made it appear vulnerable to renewed raids against it. The exact purpose for this map is opaque because the cartographer is unknown: it could denote the poverty of the city to request further aid, it could be a critique of the city which has failed to recover from the Drake raid, or it could be a statement that humanist efforts to engineer an ordered city were not going to bear fruit in Florida.

All three maps – the 1688 Zunner map, the 1589 Boazio map, and the 1595 anonymous map – share a commonality, even as their precise cartographic imaginations of St. Augustine differ. The city is almost always in the background, with the Matanzas River taking the foreground. The dolphin fish (*Coryphaena hippurus*) in the corner of the Boazio map draws the eye to it, moving to the ships, and going along the channel until finally the miniscule settlement can finally be found in the top left corner.²⁸ The

²⁷ Anonymous, *Map of Town, Fort + Channel of San Augustin* (1595), UFDC, <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/USACH00165/00001/1x>

²⁸ Giovanni Battista Boazio, *Saint Augustine Map* (1589), Library of Congress, https://www.loc.gov/resource/gdcwdl.wdl_03936/?r=0.007,0.087,0.225,0.103,0

anonymous 1595 map similarly draws attention to the Matanzas River, with its many tributaries which feed the farmland on the outskirts of the settlement, which is far smaller than Boazio's depiction.²⁹ Finally, the Zunner map uses the mentioned voyeurism of a cluster of indigenous and European people to look across the river in order to see the Castillo and the city, though some of their views are obstructed by the ships navigating the waters.³⁰ In each map, the water acts not as a natural feature, but rather the blood vessels of the city, connecting it to the rest of the Iberian Atlantic. The Spanish had little sovereignty outside of St. Augustine and within the northwest frontier of New Spain, and no control over the land between the two provinces. As such, the denizens of St. Augustine relied on the port and the channel to move across Spanish America and return to Spain. Without it, they could not send their letters complaining of poverty to the king, nor travel to Veracruz to collect the annual subsidy (*situado*). Cartographers, regardless of how they depicted St. Augustine, implicitly understood the Matanzas River, the Bahama Channel, and the Atlantic Ocean as historical agents of their own, of which St. Augustine could not survive without.

Eligio de la Puente's 1764 map of St. Augustine is a particularly useful map for determining who lived where and how the city was configured, though it is a city reconstructed after the James Moore siege of 1702. The map, which is often considered to be one of the first factual representations of the city, offers a particular piece of information that has been overlooked. Far to the left (the southeastern-most block, remembering that the city is configured south-north) is the Franciscan convent, which in

²⁹ Anonymous, *Map of Town, Fort + Channel of San Augustin* (1595), UFDC, <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/USACH00165/00001/1x>

³⁰ Jean David Zunner, *St. Augus. de Floride* (Frankfurt, 1586), JCBL, <https://jcb.lunaimaging.com/luna/servlet/detail/JCB~1~1~7143~11080003:St--Augus--de-Floride>

front of it is a slightly wider street than the rest of the blocks.³¹ The 1573 Royal Decree states that throughout the town, there should be smaller plazas on which the monasteries, parish churches, or other religious buildings are built.³² Although never explicitly stated, this appears to be a smaller plaza, called a *plazuela*, which many other Spanish American cities also had regardless of the city size. Because the convent was there before the Moore siege, it is likely that the *plazuela* was there since the convent was built.

The maps of St. Augustine produced in the 16th and 17th centuries often revealed more about the people making the maps than about the reality of the city. Boazio imagined St. Augustine as well ordered, while the mapmaker of the 1595 map saw the city as subordinate to the overwhelmingly large fort. Zunner had his own idea of how the city appeared, with a medieval castle and the city nestled beneath a mountain range. The only constant within each map was the primacy of water in the foreground, opening the city up to the world – enemies, trade, and the metropole alike. The style of cartography favorable in the post-Moore raid 18th century was new – one of “mathematical interest” and a desire to depict geographic spaces as they were rather than as a symbol of God’s providence.³³ The Puente map still has pieces of information that help better understand the city as it was in a specific historical moment and provides insight into the nature of urban space.

³¹ Elixio de la Puente, *Map of St. Augustine* (1764), https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Elixio_de_la_Puente_Map_of_St._Augustine.jpg

³² Zelia Nuttall, “Royal Ordinances Concerning the Laying Out of New Towns,” *The Hispanic American Historical Review* 5, no. 2 (May 1922), 251.

³³ Hale, *The Civilization of Europe*, 15.

Urban Space

Spanish American cities, as Rama argues, emerged from a “planned and repetitive landscape” premised upon the idea of rationalism and symmetry.³⁴ While other urban historians argue that it does not stem from the Renaissance as the focus on symmetry and humanism may imply, the image of the Americas as a blank slate allowed for nascent Renaissance ideas to bear fruit in ways that had not yet been done in Spain.³⁵ Clearly these ideas differed from late medieval notions of how a city should be organized, and Spanish America proved a capable experimental ground. The standardization of city designs was not finalized until 1573, which allowed Renaissance ideas to fully germinate and spread into policy. However, local conditions often affected the capability of following decrees, and cities like St. Augustine came to look very different from lettered cities like Havana.

St. Augustine was already designated as a city in the documents by 1586, and by the beginning of the 17th century clearly followed the 1573 Royal Decree for how cities should be laid out. Urban planners did not just believe that it was rational, but they also viewed it as healthful; open air was good for the body and could help stop the spread of miasmas. Cities in hot climates were discouraged unless necessary for the survival of Spanish colonialism in the Americas.³⁶ St. Augustine, as well as the rest of Florida, was categorized as an unhealthy place to live. To mitigate this unhealthy climate, the plaza was made along the Matanzas River, allowing the sea air to clear out the miasmatic pollutions for the health of its residents.

³⁴ Rama, *The Lettered City*, 1.

³⁵ Markman, *Architecture and Urbanization in Colonial Chiapas*, 59.

³⁶ Rebecca Earle, *The Body of the Conquistador: Food, Race and the Colonial Experience in Spanish America, 1492-1700* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 22.

The 1573 Royal Decree imagined the city as centered around the plaza, from which the main streets would divert from. The plaza serves as the center of all public life within the city; churches and the governor's residence were expected to be placed upon it. Many religious processions similarly began in the plaza, creating a meeting place for the city's residents, regardless of status. St. Augustine, as a city on a coast, was expected to place its plaza facing the water.³⁷ During this period, there was only a parish church, which is believed to have been located along the plaza as stipulated by the 1573 Royal Decree.³⁸ Like most other structures from this period, it was constructed of wood.³⁹

The greatest diversion from medieval Spanish urban design was the planned nature of the streets themselves. The city was decreed to be gridded, with regularly measured streets. While the Boazio map is usually seen as representing a reality of the city's layout, archaeological research has found that the grid did not exist until at least a decade after Drake burned down the city.⁴⁰ This may stem from a lack of money to undergo the arduous task of laying out the grid and assigning lots (*solares*), or it marks the beginnings of imperial neglect; the city's founder and greatest advocate, Pedro Menéndez de Avilés, had been long-dead by then. In addition to a late adoption of Spanish imperial city standards, the streets of St. Augustine throughout this period also remained unpaved. The streets of the city were in this period most likely just compacted earthen surfaces, which in the constant summer rains of Florida would have turned to mud quite easily and often. Maintaining the streets and the highly flammable wooden

³⁷ Nuttall, "Royal Ordinances Concerning the Laying Out of New Towns," 250.

³⁸ "A 17th century letter of Gabriel Diaz Vara Calderon, Bishop of Cuba, describing the Indians and Indian missions of Florida," *Smithsonian Miscellaneous Collections* vol. 95, 1937, p. 7, Box 29, GH 0001, GHL; Carl D. Halbirt, "Preliminary Results of Aviles Street Archaeological Project," Unpublished Report (June 2010), 1.

³⁹ Governor Quiroga to the King, August 8, 1688, p. 1, MC 63, Box 2, Folder 24, SAHS.

⁴⁰ Halbirt, "Aviles Street Archaeological Project," 26.

structures then becomes an important aspect of the urban landscape of 17th century St. Augustine.

Among one of the first laws set out by the *Siete Partidas*, Spain's legal code, mentions the necessity of keeping the streets clean.⁴¹ Because no legal code from a civil body in St. Augustine like a *cabildo* or *ayuntamiento* exists, it is necessary to draw from other cities in Spanish America to act as an example. Havana in 1566 decreed that the city's residents were responsible for the cleaning and clearing of weeds from the streets, presumably directly in front of their lots (*solares*).⁴² St. Augustine only had one *calle real*, which was maintained by royal funds, so the rest of street cleaning and clearing would have been placed on the shoulders of the city's residents.⁴³ Even with the royal funds maintaining the *calle real*, it was like every other street and still a dirt road, but it received elevated status because it led to outside of the city and into the Spanish missions.

Spanish law, like any other legal code, punished those who did not follow legal procedure. Failure to keep the street clean did not merit public lashings, but it did result in a fine; the Havana 1566 *cabildo* decided to fine residents a ducat for not cleaning the street.⁴⁴ Eight months later, the *cabildo* reiterated the law, but added that the fine would go towards public works.⁴⁵ Public works, as a concept, are understandably vague; there

⁴¹ Tomo I, Primera Partida, Titulo I, Ley XII, "Quien ha poder de fazer leyes," in *Las Siete Partidas* (1555), 7.

⁴² "Cabildo 14 marzo de 1566" in *Actas capitulares del ayuntamiento de la Habana, Tomo II: 1566-1574*, ed. Antonio Beruff Mendieta (Havana: Municipio de la Habana, 1939), 16.

⁴³ Carl D. Halbirt, "Of Earth, Tabby, Brick, and Asphalt: The Archaeology of St. Augustine's Historic St. George Street," *El Escribano* 34 (1997), 76.

⁴⁴ "Cabildo 14 marzo de 1566" in *Actas capitulares del ayuntamiento de la Habana, Tomo II: 1566-1574*, ed. Antonio Beruff Mendieta (Havana: Municipio de la Habana, 1939), 16.

⁴⁵ "Cabildo 8 noviembre de 1566" in *Actas capitulares del ayuntamiento de la Habana, Tomo II: 1566-1574*, ed. Antonio Beruff Mendieta (Havana: Municipio de la Habana, 1939), 31.

were many “public works” that Havana may have used the revenue for, including fort construction and maintenance, street improvements or cleaning, or building and maintaining municipal buildings. Havana’s *cabildo* in effect told its residents that if they would not maintain the streets, they would fine them an exorbitant fee. This money also went toward the cost of the royal slaves who helped work on the construction projects both in Havana and St. Augustine.⁴⁶

St. Augustine similarly issued fines for crimes throughout the 1680s. A conflict arose between sergeant-mayor Don Pablo de Hita and Salvador de Cigarroa in which “injurious words” had been said.⁴⁷ In order to maintain respectability in the city between these two men, they were told that if more words were said between them, then they would be fined three hundred escudos “applied to His Majesty’s Royal Chamber and the construction of the Castillo.”⁴⁸ Pedro Lujano was fined sixty pesos of eight reales for wounding an indigenous man from Guale province named Manuel Martín. The notary mentions that the fine would go towards “His Majesty’s chamber, the construction of the Royal fort, and expenses of Justice.”⁴⁹ These two cases are the only examples of fines used in the city but provide insight into how fines were leveraged for public works in similar ways as in Havana.

Fines were rare in the 1680s, but a more common punishment was forced labor on the Castillo. While fines still punished people like Pablo de Hita, who had served as

⁴⁶ See Evelyn Jennings, *Constructing the Spanish Empire in Havana: State Slavery in Defense and Development, 1762-1835* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2020) and Jane Landers, *Black Society in Spanish Florida* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1999), 18.

⁴⁷ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, July 22, 1682, p. 9, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

⁴⁸ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, July 22, 1682, p. 10, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

⁴⁹ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, September 10, 1688, p. 6, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

governor two years before his public dispute with Salvador de Cigarroa, men such as himself were ineligible for forced labor or public punishment. Many of those condemned to forced labor were of indigenous or African descent, creating a labor force who may not be enslaved, but were forced to work for the city. Fines were one-time payments, but forced labor often lasted a significant amount of time. Simón, a native of the province of Apalachee who will be discussed in more detail later, was given four years of hard labor on the Castillo after being publicly whipped through the streets.⁵⁰

In a cash-strapped economy like St. Augustine's, it also made more sense to use forced labor as punishment rather than fining. The necessity of constructing the Castillo to ensure the protection of the *presidio* meant that a consistent labor force was in high demand, even though it certainly only comprised a miniscule fraction of the workers. The paucity of documents makes it difficult to make judgments about how many people were forced into hard labor. Furthermore, the relative invisibility of both indigenous and enslaved people in St. Augustine during the 17th century comprises a subsection of the urban population whose contributions to public works like the Castillo are obscured.

The influx of indigenous people who went to St. Augustine to help with constructing the Castillo resulted in a significant change in the urban landscape. While a population estimate mentions about 2700 natives living in and around the city in 1702, the 1685 estimate only mentions 1400 European descended people and no number for indigenous and indigenous descended people.⁵¹ Additionally, as early as 1593, people were requesting enslaved laborers to work on fortification projects and other royal works,

⁵⁰ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, Undated, p. 11, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

⁵¹ Population Patterns, Box 21, GH 0001, GHL.

though it is unlikely that many ships brought the requested slaves.⁵² Nonetheless, Governor Don Manuel de Cendoya's inventory upon his death in 1673 mention slaves of Portuguese and Arara nationality, as well as a slave from Campeche and one from an unidentified location.⁵³ Slave inventories and the handful of criminal cases from the 1680s are among the rare instances of slave life mentioned in 17th century St. Augustine. The Castillo was a monumental construction effort, and only a part of the picture of the workers is available because of the dearth of documents.

In 1756, Don Pedro Sánchez Griñán commented that “the pattern of the streets and houses” in St. Augustine “differ very little from other towns” in Spanish America.⁵⁴ The city maintained legal and social apparatuses comparable to Havana in light of clear colonial neglect. It attempted to use the humanistic and symmetrical composition of the city to project a semblance of order and power, though it was often undermined by its impoverished material conditions. Although many of the components are easily found in other Spanish American cities, the fact that they existed in St. Augustine indicate civil life that may otherwise have been ignored. The near-total invisibility of indigenous, enslaved, and forced laborers in the construction of the Castillo and other public works also shines light on a part of the city that deserves additional scholarship.

⁵² Carta del alférez Hernando de Mestas, 1593, MC 63, Box 1, Folder 30, SAHS.

⁵³ Inventory of Goods of Don Manuel de Cendoya, March 8, 1673, p. 4 & 13, MC 63, Box 2, Folder 11, SAHS.

⁵⁴ Jesus Maria Belmonte and Michel Scardaville, “Florida in the Late First Spanish Period: The 1756 Griñán Report” in *The Military and Militia in Colonial Spanish America, St. Augustine, Florida* (St. Augustine: Florida National Guard, 1982), 92.

Spectacle

English pirate Andrew Ranson was sentenced to death by garroting.⁵⁵ He had been caught along with the rest of his crew in the previous summer, and in October 1684 he was brought to a scaffold presumably in the plaza. By what the clergy considered a miracle, the cord broke, and his life was spared. Interim parish priest Joseph Pérez de la Mota, joined by three Franciscans, took Ranson and gave him ecclesiastical asylum to the chagrin of Governor Juan Márquez Cabrera. Governor Cabrera expressed concerns that Ranson had once converted in Havana to escape punishment, and he feared a similar outcome in St. Augustine.⁵⁶ While the Ranson story is an example of conflicts between Governor Cabrera and the Franciscans, it also offers rich insight into the nature of public punishment in St. Augustine.

Michel Foucault argues that the nature of public punishment is to make “the guilty man the herald of his own punishment.”⁵⁷ Public punishment serves to deter the community from committing crimes, as well as identifying the criminal among their peers and neighbors. A small city like St. Augustine left little opportunity for anonymity, so public punishment served as a means of social control and regulator of order within society. From a criminological perspective, it telegraphed to residents what was acceptable and what had to be punished. The focus of the health of the city does not end with the creation of urban space; the unclean also had to be purged to keep the city clean. Ranson as an outsider served other purposes; St. Augustine existed on the fringes,

⁵⁵ Robert L. Kapitzke, *Religion, Power, and Politics in Colonial St. Augustine* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2001), 48.

⁵⁶ Governor Juan Márquez Cabrera to the King, November 3, 1685, p. 5, MC 63, Box 2, Folder 6, The Brooks’ Transcripts, trans. Annie Averette, SAHS.

⁵⁷ Michel Foucault, *Discipline & Punish: The Birth of the Prison*, trans. Alan Sheridan (New York: Vintage Books, 1991), 43.

vulnerable to external enemies, so his execution would project power and reinforce the necessity of the *presidio*'s existence.

Ranson's position on the scaffolds bore his condition as a criminal condemned to death before the community, serving to assuage a colonial anxiety that plagued the city – that of piracy. Pirates have a long history in the Caribbean, and their presence is no less significant in the history of St. Augustine. Not only had Sir Francis Drake burned down the city in 1586, but Robert Searles's raid in 1668 precipitated the building of the Castillo de San Marcos, a work of masonry that cost an estimated 122,656 pesos.⁵⁸ The fear of piracy had grown so great in the late 17th century that it justified vast expenditures that the Crown had been unwilling to invest since the city's founding. These fears and anxieties manifested in Governor Cabrera's desire to have Ranson executed, while the rest of his men were sentenced to hard labor; he was setting an example of Ranson.

The description provided by Governor Cabrera offers insight into the public nature of Ranson's execution. Because death sentences seem so rare, the existence of a scaffold is surprising. There was, according to Governor Cabrera, a 13-month period between Ranson's capture and attempted execution, which would give them ample time to build one.⁵⁹ The scaffold most likely would have been done in the plaza, which was the center of public life in all Spanish American cities. The Franciscans that gave asylum to Ranson had to "break through the guard," which was comprised of a sergeant and twelve men.⁶⁰ So many guards protecting him may imply that there was a significant crowd that had gathered to see the execution, many of whom also soldiers. The Franciscans were not

⁵⁸ Luis Rafael Arana, "The Endurance of Castillo de San Marcos," *El Escribano* 41 (2004), 50.

⁵⁹ Governor Juan Márquez Cabrera to the King, November 3, 1685, p. 5, MC 63, Box 2, Folder 6, The Brooks' Transcripts, trans. Annie Averette, SAHS.

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 5.

part of the ceremony, giving Ranson his last rites, but rather spectators themselves. Furthermore, they had to get past the guards who were tasked with ensuring the successful garroting of Ranson. Governor Cabrera's descriptions offer a new way to visualize the execution, its logistics, who spectated, and who participated.

Governor Cabrera charged that the Franciscans took the rope that had miraculously been broken, placed it in the hands of the Most Holy Virgin del Rosario, and brought the image out of the church in a religious procession.⁶¹ What had been intended to become a cathartic execution of colonial fears surrounding piracy became one of celebration; the procession celebrated the miracle by walking along the streets to the ringing of the parish church bell.⁶² While processions were part of public life in St. Augustine throughout the year, this miracle was impromptu and most likely followed familiar routes along the main thoroughfares after starting from the parish church. If the procession passed by the governor's residence, it served as a reminder of public defiance against his orders. The political implications are obvious, but the Franciscans took opportunities like the Ranson situation to assert divergent public spaces, which questioned the authority of Governor Cabrera. To accomplish this task, they mobilized the public spectacle of the procession; if Governor Cabrera had dispersed it, he only would have upset the city's denizens.⁶³

Andrew Ranson is extraordinary because he is the only example of a pirate sentenced to death in St. Augustine during the 17th century, and though there were others, none faced the same fate as him. The scant few cases in 17th century, which are from the

⁶¹ Ibid., p. 5.

⁶² Kapitzke, *Religion, Power, and Politics in Colonial St. Augustine*, 19.

⁶³ Ibid., 48-49.

1680s almost exclusively, St. Augustine are mostly internal affairs, or controversies trickling in from the Spanish missions in Timucua and Apalachee. Similarly, his death sentence is unusual; other criminals faced public punishments, exile, hard labor, or fines, but not death. Ranson's execution-turned-procession provides one way of understanding the nature of spectacle, but the punishment of residents of St. Augustine seldom contains the same level of drama.

The other public form of punishment was whipping the condemned through the streets of the city. All the documents are from the 1680s, though it is unclear why. While Father Alonso de Leturiondo commented only two decades later that the governor was unable to enforce justice, it is possible that he only said as much as a means of depicting the city as impoverished before the king.⁶⁴ The handful of available cases offer valuable insight into conditions within the city, the infrastructures of justice, and the role that public space played in the meting out of justice. St. Augustine, unlike cities like Havana, did not maintain a *cabildo* or *ayuntamiento*.⁶⁵ Evidence from the court cases indicate that the problem of justice was the lack of people in the city qualified to hold trials and make recommendations for the penalty. The governors, emboldened by the city's lack of a *cabildo*, made unilateral decisions when they did not need to be sent to trial, as evidenced by the scandal with Governor Cabrera and the execution of Andrew Ranson, as well as cases throughout the 1680s.

Simón, an indigenous man from the town of Yuitachuco in Apalachee, was not subjected to a trial, but he was given one hundred lashes "through the public streets" after

⁶⁴ Leturiondo's 1700 Deposition to the King, 1700, p. 37, Box 32, GH 0001, GHL.

⁶⁵ Evidence Pertinent to the Florida Cabildo Controversy and Misdating of the Juan Marquez Cabrera Governorship, MS 0-61, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039461/00001>

he confessed to stealing from the home of a soldier in the city.⁶⁶ Simón is most likely one of many indigenous people who came to live in St. Augustine because of the massive labor requirements to build the Castillo de San Marcos, both as drafted and voluntary laborers.⁶⁷ The labor was especially grueling, with governors noting that the hard labor contributed to the continued depopulation of the indigenous people of Florida.⁶⁸ Between the hard labor and meager rations given to the indigenous workers, people like Simón may have had to turn to stealing to survive. Simón admitted to stealing from Marcos Ferz, a soldier in the city, on two separate occasions.⁶⁹ Because he confessed to the crimes, the governor (whose name is not mentioned in the case) had him punished for the crime without a trial.

Another example of public punishment in St. Augustine concerns three enslaved men, an unnamed one, Tomás de la Torre and Joseph, as well as Juan Osorio, a *chino* (presumably someone with indigenous and *mestizo* parents) forced laborer. The four of them attempted to escape to San Jorge (Charleston) but were caught before they could do so. Only Tomás de la Torre was given two hundred lashes, perhaps because they identified him as the organizer of the *marronage*, but all of them were sentenced to several years of hard labor on the Castillo.⁷⁰ The case is instructive not only because of its mention of public punishment, but also because of what it describes of urban society

⁶⁶ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, Case 23, Undated, p. 11, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

⁶⁷ Governor Manuel de Cendoya to the Queen Regent, December 24, 1673, MC 63, Box 2, Folder 10, SAHS.

⁶⁸ Governor Nicolás Ponce de León to the Council of Indies, May 8, 1674, MC 63, Box 2, Folder 12, SAHS.

⁶⁹ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, Case 23, Undated, p. 11, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

⁷⁰ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, Undated, p. 10, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

in St. Augustine in the late 17th century. St. Augustine was not a military *presidio* inhabited entirely by soldiers and their families. There were enslaved Africans and indigenous and indigenous-descended laborers who created their own networks amongst themselves. They worked alongside each other and conspired to escape elsewhere when given the opportunity, and as a result they were punished together as well.

The case of the attempted escape to Charleston also complicates the historiography of black life in St. Augustine. About fifty years separates the trial and the unconditional emancipation of runaway slaves arriving to Florida in 1738 and the establishment of Fort Mose a year later.⁷¹ While Florida in the early to mid-18th century stood as a sanctuary and beacon of hope to many enslaved Africans who hoped for freedom, the situation in the 17th century was different. Any number of reasons may have motivated the four of them to conspire to run away, but the fact that Juan Osorio was already condemned to forced labor on the Castillo may provide an explanation. About a decade of hard work forced upon the royal slaves and displaced Natives, and still a decade away from completing construction of the Castillo, may have given them the idea to run away instead of toil over the work unceasingly.⁷²

Whipping was used more frequently in the provinces of Florida, located in modern-day Gainesville and Tallahassee, far away from the gaze of the royal and city officials. The Franciscans, tasked with catechizing the indigenous people of Florida, often abused them instead. Whippings for missing mass, not bringing enough hickory nuts, or participating in forbidden dances were enough to draw the ire of some Franciscans in the

⁷¹ Jane Landers, *Black Society in Spanish Florida* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1999), 28.

⁷² Arana's "The Endurance of Castillo de San Marcos" discusses the work on the Castillo that constantly had to be redone, making the project seem unending and increasingly pointless.

missions.⁷³ Unlike the whippings done in the city, they had no basis in any legal codes, nor legal precedent in other cities in the 17th century Iberian Atlantic. Governor Cabrera cracked down on such activities when he became aware of them, though it may be impossible to know when the abuses and severe punishments began.⁷⁴ Mentioning the treatment of indigenous people in the missions does not serve to justify the violence inflicted in St. Augustine, but rather to argue that there are legal processes that regulate when whippings could be used.

The two cases that resulted in public whippings – an indigenous man stealing from a soldier’s house and enslaved and forced laborers conspiring to run away – share commonalities in that the perpetrators whipped were either of African or indigenous descent. The *Recopilación de las leyes de los reynos de las Indias* decreed that soldiers could not be publicly whipped.⁷⁵ Similar to rules of torture, it was unlikely for men of good reputation, *hidalgos*, or royal officials would ever be publicly whipped, either. Because the *presidio* had so many soldiers, it was unlikely for anyone other than African or indigenous descended people to face public whippings. The laws decreed in the *Recopilación* probably did not intend for this specific outcome, but because St. Augustine was organized in the way that it was, the victims of public punishment were most likely always from one of those two groups of people. In contrast, soldiers would most likely be condemned to hard labor, and officials pay fines. The law racialized public punishment, with the failed execution of Andrew Ranson being an exception.

⁷³ Controversy Between Governor Marquez Cabrera and Franciscan Friars over Operation of the Missions, 1680-1681, p. 41, MS 0-17, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00040206/00001>

⁷⁴ The documents do not necessarily explain the charges levied against the Franciscans beyond the abuses, nor do they explain how they were corrected.

⁷⁵ Tomo I, Libro III, Título XI, Ley XV, “Que á los Soldados no se imponga pena de azotes, ni vergüenza,” in *Recopilación de las leyes de los reynos de las Indias* (Madrid, May 18, 1680), 611. https://www.boe.es/biblioteca_juridica/abrir_pdf.php?id=PUB-LH-1998-62_1

Both cases mention that they were to be given lashes “through the public streets.”⁷⁶ Whipping routes were used as further means of social control. Not only did the condemned suffer the lashes in the plaza, but they were brought along a set path like a procession. It ensured that the people of the town saw it, or at least heard the crack of the whip as it passed by their house. Because most houses in St. Augustine during this period were one-stories, mostly made of boarded or thatched frames, the sound of the whippings would probably have been audible even for those sitting inside.⁷⁷ While the front door was in the side yard away from the street, houses almost certainly a window facing the street for people to watch through as the procession passed by.⁷⁸ The hyper visibility of the ritual served to deter the rest of the denizens from repeating the same crimes as the condemned, and the act of whipping the person would serve as a physical reminder of their crime.

Considering where the whipping route would go through the city would help try to understand the city’s most important streets and thoroughfares, where the punishment would be its most public. Because there are no gridded maps until the early 18th century, cartographic evidence is useless, and archaeological research becomes important. The 1680s were a time of significant development; while Manucy believed that construction of the Castillo took up most of the manpower, it was precisely during its construction that the part of the city north of the plaza began to develop. Before then, present-day St. George Street (then a *calle real*) was described as nothing more than a foot path.⁷⁹

⁷⁶ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, Undated, p. 10-11, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

⁷⁷ Albert Manucy, *The Houses of St. Augustine, 1565-1821* (St. Augustine: The St. Augustine Historical Society, 1962), 62.

⁷⁸ Manucy, *The Houses of St. Augustine*, 12.

⁷⁹ Halbirt, “Of Earth, Tabby, Brick, and Asphalt,” 70.

Similarly, the street behind Los Remedios, the parish church from 1565 to 1702, was not built further north until after the church was abandoned after the Moore raid.⁸⁰ The street, which is now called Aviles Street, is one of the oldest in the city, dating to the early 17th century.⁸¹

From this information, it makes sense that the whipping route most likely would have remained through the southern thoroughfares – starting at the plaza in front of the governor’s house, south down the *calle real* to the Franciscan convent and the *plazuela* it sat on, heading east toward what is now called Charlotte Street and then heading north to the parish church, and returning to the plaza. This route would go down every major road in 17th century St. Augustine, near every royal official’s house, and go past many of the residential homes. Above all else, imagining the whipping route allows the opportunity to imagine how power is expressed not only in acts like a whipping route, but also in the placement of buildings to express authority over the population.

The cases discussed so far have been related to property, which especially in a cash-strapped local economy, officials felt they needed to defend. There were also crimes punished publicly that related to sex and reproductive rights, all concerning the disconnect between Spanish and indigenous cultural values. Governor Laureano Torres y Ayala between late 1694 and early 1695 ordered Captain Joaquín de Florencia to inspect Spanish Timucua (around present-day Gainesville) and reaffirm loyalties to the Spanish.⁸² He accomplished all manner of things while in Spanish Timucua, but of

⁸⁰ Halbirt, “Aviles Street Archaeological Project,” 7.

⁸¹ Halbirt, “Aviles Street Archaeological Project,” 25; Historians have traditionally dated the street to being from the late 16th century, but this report indicates otherwise after digging through the various deposit levels.

⁸² Fred Lamar Pearson, Jr., “The Florencia Investigation of Spanish Timucua,” *Florida Historical Quarterly* 51, no. 2 (Oct. 1972), 167.

particular interest was his treatment of an indigenous woman. She had used local herbs to medically induce several abortions, which clearly offended Florencia. He told her in front of her community that “if she committed the offense again her hair would be cut, and she would receive fifty lashes.”⁸³ Every aspect of his threat to her not only was public but showed their divergent cultural values. Not only did he oppose abortion, but he would shame her by cutting her hair – something that meant nothing to him, but everything to her bodily autonomy. Cutting her hair meant stripping her of her identity as a Timucua woman, but to him it held no significance other than to punish her. It is also significant to note that this is one of the rare examples in which a woman is threatened with being lashed under legal pretenses – men were almost always the ones being whipped.

Also in Spanish Timucua, three indigenous men were condemned for participating in the *pecado nefando* – the nefarious sin – which Zeb Tortorici identifies as including “sodomy, bestiality, and masturbation.”⁸⁴ While the document is vague in its wording, it appears that it was two men “cooperating” in committing sodomy.⁸⁵ There is evidence that sodomy “was a part of Timucuan sexual practices,” so while it was seen as a sin to the Spanish, it was not strange to the ones committing it.⁸⁶ The case was sent to a *vecino* in Havana, presumably from a lack of people able to try it in St. Augustine, and the licentiate Don Juan Díaz de León found them guilty and sentenced them to death by garroting. The governor agreed, and so the act was carried out in St. Augustine. Unlike

⁸³ Pearson Jr., “The Florencia Investigation,” 172.

⁸⁴ Zeb Tortorici, *Sins Against Nature: Sex & Archives in Colonial New Mexico* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2018), 2.

⁸⁵ Crime and Punishment in La Florida in the 1680s, Undated, p. 9, MS 0-67, John H. Hann Collection, UFDC. <https://ufdc.ufl.edu/AA00039629/00001>

⁸⁶ Tamara Spike, “To Make Graver this Sin: Conceptions of Purity and Pollution Among the Timucua of Spanish Florida,” (PhD. diss., Florida State University, Tallahassee, 2006), 107, Florida State University Libraries Electronic Theses, Treatises, and Dissertations.

Andrew Ranson, no miracle saved them, and their unceremonious deaths were not given another page of documentation.

Public punishment played a large part in the creation of a social order imagined by Spanish legalists and colonial officials. Many different crimes – from the stealing of property to medically-induced abortions – could cause a public reprimand that would use violence to discourage the condemned from repeating the crime, and to deter the audience considering doing it as well. All the crimes discussed, except for Ranson, were perpetrated by people subjugated by the Spanish, and so the lashes served as a harsh lesson. The Timucuan men garroted for sodomy stand out from this, because the Spanish viewed their sin as so horrible that they deserved to die. Public punishment, on a practical level in St. Augustine, was not just social control, but a violent enforcement of new morals impressed upon a population who never truly made the choice to accept these new societal norms and expectations.

Conclusion

The early colonial peripheral city is difficult to understand in its totality, and St. Augustine is no different. The cartographers who depicted it between 1586 and 1702 often did so symbolically, distorting reality to imagine the city as a beacon of civilization, an abject failure, or an anachronism of a bygone era. Public rituals like punishments and processions remind the citizenry of the city and empire's values and ideals, reinforcing order and the colonial ethos. Urban space can be understood in many ways: it can mean the building materials, the layout of the city, the expectations thrust upon residents, or the way in which invisible populations faded into the background, working on building the urban landscape, as conflicts between governors and the clergy raged.

Historian Engel Sluiter in 1985 identified how governors, clergy, and every other resident of St. Augustine writing to the king vastly overexaggerated the poverty of the *presidio*. Constant complaints about the late arrival of the *situado* were not based on fact aside from a handful of years.⁸⁷ Many of them also invoked a sort of nostalgia, saying that earlier decades had years of prosperity in the city which have long since passed, leaving them in abject poverty. Leturiondo complained that ships used to pass through the port all the time, invigorating the economy and keeping the *presidio* safe.⁸⁸ Writing in 1700, he does not give a time frame in which they golden age of St. Augustine participating in a wider world of trade with Campeche and Havana. Governor Francisco de la Guerra y de la Vega wrote in 1666 about how late the *situado* was, and the abject

⁸⁷ Engel Sluiter, *The Florida Situado: Quantifying the First Eighty Years, 1571-1651* (Gainesville: University of Florida Libraries, 1985), 2.

⁸⁸ Leturiondo's 1700 Deposition to the King, 1700, p. 34, Box 32, GH 0001, GHL.

poverty that the city found itself in.⁸⁹ While Sluiter's study does not go up to the 1660s, the general trends seem to indicate that New Spain probably was not as late as he argues.

The incessant complaining was a form of theatre performed for the king to extract some sort of benefit from him. Among the most significant reasons has to do with foodways. The introduction of cows and pigs did not yield self-sustaining herds as may have been expected, because of the abundance of predators like lions.⁹⁰ As a result, the Spanish came to depend on maize grown by the indigenous people of Florida to survive, especially with how few ships came into port throughout the 17th century.⁹¹ While they begrudgingly ate it, they believed that over-indulgence could pose a serious health risk.⁹² As a result, complaints of hunger may not have been actually as dire as city officials made it seem, but rather a desire to eat more healthful foods that the Iberian constitution was more accustomed to. In the late 16th century, the governors preferred to kill the lean cows and pigs rather than eat the native food that was all around them.⁹³ Similarly, the Boazio map and 1595 map both show farmlands in the immediate vicinity, refuting claims from the colonists that the soil was too impoverished to grow crops.

The complaints often had another purpose: to break trade regulations. Spain had strict laws that prevented any Spanish American colony from trading with anyone other than the monopoly holders in Seville and Cádiz.⁹⁴ Leturiondo directly advocated for

⁸⁹ Letter from Governor Francisco de la Guerra y de la Vega to the King, April 8, 1666, MC 63, Box 2, Folder 4, SAHS.

⁹⁰ Manucy, "The Physical Setting of Sixteenth Century St. Augustine," 39.

⁹¹ Tamara Spike, "St. Augustine's Stomach: Corn and Indian Tribute Labor in Spanish Florida" in *Florida's Working-Class Past: Current Perspectives on Labor, Race, and Gender from Spanish Florida to the New Immigration*, eds. Robert Cassanello and Melanie Shell-Weiss (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2009), 17.

⁹² Earle, *The Body of the Conquistador*, 143.

⁹³ Manucy, "The Physical Setting of Sixteenth Century St. Augustine," 39.

⁹⁴ Joyce Elizabeth Harman, *Trade and Privateering in Spanish Florida, 1732-1763* (St. Augustine: The St. Augustine Historical Society, 1969), 4.

trading with ships from Havana rather than just those from New Spain, so that the *presidio* would be able to survive.⁹⁵ When necessary, the city's residents turned to trading with the occasional Dutch merchants that came into port.⁹⁶ Griñán also mentioned trade with the English, which very well may have happened illicitly over the years, especially after 1670, when British vessels were allowed to go into Spanish American ports if they were in distress.⁹⁷ The complaints were used to receive the permission from the Crown for activities that the townsfolk were already engaged in.

Multiple layers of St. Augustine were imagined throughout the 17th century, either through cartography, urban planning, bureaucratic complaints, or public spectacles. Each served a purpose in representing the city, which in effect distorts the actual realities. The study of each provides further insight, but the layers cannot be understood without considering all of them together. This is not necessarily new; historians of Florida have often used these sources in tandem but have nonetheless arrived at different conclusions. The preconceived notions and understanding that St. Augustine would one day become American makes it more difficult to see the clearly Spanish American foundations of the city. Accepting this fact is more than just a statement, but an epistemology and outlook. Placing St. Augustine within the frameworks of New Spain and the Spanish Caribbean reveal that the city was typical of cities that existed on the periphery. St. Augustine was privileged because of its utility to Spanish imperial apparatuses but was nonetheless not a lettered city as Rama imagines the term to mean. The city's inability to generate revenue is not surprising; not every settlement in Spanish America was Zacatecas or Potosí, nor

⁹⁵ Leturiondo's 1700 Deposition to the King, 1700, p. 35, Box 32, GH 0001, GHL.

⁹⁶ Spike, "St. Augustine's Stomach," in *Florida's Working-Class Past*, 26.

⁹⁷ Belmonte and Scardaville, "The 1756 Griñán Report" in *The Military and Militia in Colonial Spanish America, St. Augustine, Florida*, 95.

did it have the possibility for sugar production like Havana would in the 18th and 19th centuries. This does not mean that the city should never have existed – it means that despite everything, the city managed to persist, which for many peripheral Spanish American cities was enough.

Bibliography

Books

- Andrews, Kenneth R. *The Spanish Caribbean: Trade and Plunder, 1530-1630*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1978.
- Bannon, John Frances. *The Spanish Borderlands Frontier, 1513-1821*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1970.
- Bolton, Herbert Eugene. *The Spanish Borderlands: A Chronicle of Old Florida and the Southwest*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1921.
- Bushnell, Amy. *The King's Coffers: Proprietors of the Spanish Florida Treasury, 1565-1702*. Gainesville: University Presses of Florida, 1981.
- Earle, Rebecca. *The Body of the Conquistador: Food, Race and the Colonial Experience in Spanish America, 1492-1700*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Foucault, Michel. *Discipline & Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. Translated by Alan Sheridan. New York: Vintage Books, 1991.
- Gannon, Michael V. *The Cross in the Sand: The Early Catholic Church in Florida*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1965.
- Hale, John. *The Civilization of Europe in the Renaissance*. New York: Atheneum, 1993.
- Harman, Joyce Elizabeth. *Trade and Privateering in Spanish Florida, 1732-1763*. St. Augustine: The St. Augustine Historical Society, 1969.
- Hoffman, Paul E. *A New Andalusia and a Way to the Orient: The American Southeast During the Sixteenth Century*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University, 2004.
- Jennings, Evelyn. *Constructing the Spanish Empire in Havana: State Slavery in Defense and Development, 1762-1835*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2020.
- Johnson, Jessica Marie. *Wicked Flesh: Black Women, Intimacy, and Freedom in the Atlantic World*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2020.
- Kagan, Richard L. *Urban Images of the Hispanic World, 1493-1793*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000.
- Kapitzke, Robert L. *Religion, Power, and Politics in Colonial St. Augustine*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2001.

- Landers, Jane. *Black Society in Spanish Florida*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1999.
- Lyon, Eugene. *The Enterprise of Florida: Pedro Menendez de Aviles and the Spanish Conquest of 1565-1568*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1983.
- MacKay, Ruth. *Life in a Time of Pestilence: The Great Castilian Plague of 1596-1601*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.
- Manucy, Albert. *The Houses of St. Augustine, 1565-1821*. St. Augustine: The St. Augustine Historical Society, 1962.
- Markman, Sidney David. *Architecture and Urbanization in Colonial Chiapas, Mexico*. Philadelphia: The American Philosophical Society, 1984.
- McMichael, Andrew. *Atlantic Loyalties: Americans in Spanish West Florida, 1785-1810*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2008.
- Mundy, Barbara E. *The Mapping of New Spain: Indigenous Cartography and the Maps of the Relaciones Geográficas*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996.
- Rama, Ángel. *The Lettered City*. Translated by John Charles Chasteen. Durham: Duke University Press, 1996.
- Shafer, Daniel L. *Anna Madgigine Jai Kingsley: African Princess, Florida Slave, Plantation Slaveowner*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2003.
- Sluiter, Engel. *The Florida Situado: Quantifying the First Eighty Years, 1571-1651*. Gainesville: University of Florida Libraries, 1985.
- Tortorici, Zeb. *Sins Against Nature: Sex & Archives in Colonial New Mexico*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2018.
- Vidal, Cécile. *Caribbean New Orleans: Empire, Race, and the Making of a Slave Society*. Williamsburg: Omohundro Institute of Early American History & Culture, 2019.
- Weber, David J. *The Spanish Frontier in North America*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992.

Book Chapters

- Pepper, Simon. "Siege law, siege ritual, and the symbolism of the city walls in Renaissance Europe." In *City Walls: The Urban Enceinte in Global Perspective*, edited by James D. Tracy. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.

Spike, Tamara. "St. Augustine's Stomach: Corn and Indian Tribute Labor in Spanish Florida." In *Florida's Working-Class Past: Current Perspectives on Labor, Race, and Gender from Spanish Florida to the New Immigration*, edited by Robert Cassanello and Melanie Shell-Weiss. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2009.

Upton, Dell, "The Master Street of the World: The Levee." In *Streets: Critical Perspectives on Public Space*, edited by Zeynep Çelik, Diane Favro, and Richard Ingersoll. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994.

Journal Articles

Arana, Luis Rafael. "The Endurance of Castillo de San Marcos," *El Escribano* 41 (2004): 9-68.

Halbirt, Carl D. "Of Earth, Tabby, Brick, and Asphalt: The Archaeology of St. Augustine's Historic St. George Street." *El Escribano* 34 (1997): 70-97.

Manucy, Albert. "The Physical Setting of Sixteenth Century St. Augustine." *The Florida Archaeologist* 38, no. 1 (March 1985): 34-53.

Pearson, Jr., Fred Lamar. "The Florencia Investigation of Spanish Timucua." *Florida Historical Quarterly* 51, no. 2 (Oct. 1972): 166-176.

Dissertations & Unpublished Reports

Halbirt, Carl D. "Preliminary Results of Aviles Street Archaeological Project." Unpublished Report (June 2010).

Spike, Tamara. "To Make Graver this Sin: Conceptions of Purity and Pollution Among the Timucua of Spanish Florida." Ph.D. diss., Florida State University, Tallahassee, 2006. Florida State University Libraries Electronic Theses, Treatises, and Dissertations.

Published Primary Sources

Belmonte, Jesus Maria and Scardaville, Michel. "Florida in the Late First Spanish Period: The 1756 Griñán Report." In *The Military and Militia in Colonial Spanish America, St. Augustine, Florida*. St. Augustine: Florida National Guard, 1982.

Beruff Mendieta, Antonio, ed. *Actas capitulares del ayuntamiento de la Habana, Tomo II: 1566-1574*. Havana: Municipio de la Habana, 1939.

Nuttall, Zelia. "Royal Ordinances Concerning the Laying Out of New Towns." *The Hispanic American Historical Review* 5, no. 2 (May 1922): 249-254.

Recopilación de las leyes de los reynos de las Indias. Madrid, May 18, 1680.

Las Siete Partidas. 1555.

Archives Consulted

Governor's House Library. St. Augustine, FL.

John Carter Brown Library. Online.

Library of Congress. Online.

St. Augustine Historical Society. St. Augustine, FL

University of Florida Digital Collection. Online.

Wikimedia Commons. Online.

Biography

Keith Richards is a PhD student at Tulane University, where he studies urban spaces in the 17th century Caribbean, with a focus on eastern Cuba and Spanish Florida. His interests include public space, expressions of power, and cartography. He is particularly interested in how urban spaces in colonial peripheries serve as forms of sovereignty and legitimizations of colonialism.